

Impacts of the COVID-19 Pandemic on Teacher Trainees and Students:

The Case of the National Institute for Special Education (NISE) and Five High Schools for Special Education in Cambodia











Disclaimer This study was supported by the Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade through The Asia Foundation's Ponlok Chomnes: Data and Dialogue for Development in Cambodia Program. The views expressed in this study are the authors' alone and are not necessarily the views of the Australian Government or The Asia Foundation, nor National Institute for Special Education. Copyright © NUM Research Center 2023

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	3
2.	Research Objectives and Questions	4
3.	Research methodology, scope and contribution of the study	5
4. Cambo	Reviews of Related Laws, Policies and Frameworks on People with Disabilities in odia	
4.1	The 1993 Cambodia's Constitution	5
4.2	Law on Education 2007	<i>6</i>
4.3	Law on the Protection and the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities 2009	
4.4	Cambodia Sustainable Development Goal (CSDG)	9
4.5	Rectangular Strategy of the Royal Government of Cambodia	
4.6	The National Disability Strategic Plan (NDSP) 2014-2018	10
4.7	Policy on Inclusive Education by the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport in 20)1811
4.8	Cambodia Education Response Plan to COVID-19 Pandemic	12
5.	ASEAN Frameworks Related to Persons with Disabilities and COVID-19 Respons	ses 14
5.1	ASEAN Enabling Master Plan 2025: Mainstreaming the Rights of Persons with Disabilities	14
6. of Aus	Reviews of Policies and Responses Related to COVID-19 on Persons with Disabil stralia	
7.1	Australian Human Rights Commission Act 1986	16
7.2	Australian Government Preparedness and Responses to COVID-19	17
7.	Findings: Impacts of COVID-19 on Students with Disabilities	19
7.1	Impacts of COVID-19 on Students' Emotion and Wellbeing	21
7.2	Impacts of COVID-19 on Student's Learning	23
7.3	Impacts of COVID-19 on Parental Selective Behavior	27
7.4	COVID-19 Impacts and Inclusive Classroom	29
8.	Conclusion and Recommendations	29
9.	Case Study: Australian Successful School Intervention	31
Appen	idixes	35

1. Introduction

In Cambodia, there are 689,532 persons with disabilities, of which 74.3% are partial disabilities, 19.4% are serious disabilities, and 6.3% are absolute disabilities. Persons with disabilities are protected by international conventions and local laws aiming to ensure that persons with disabilities can fully enjoy freedoms and rights, including but not limited to the right to nondiscrimination, right to participation and inclusion in society, equality in opportunities, right to accessibilities and equal treatments, and that their dignities are respected as human beings.² The United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, adopted on July 3, 2009 has defined persons with disabilities as "those who have long-term physical, mental, intellectual or sensory impairments which in interaction with various barriers may hinder their full and effective participation in society on an equal basis with others". Similarly, Cambodia's Law on the Protection and the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities promulgated on July 3, 2009 has also defined persons with disabilities as "any persons who lack, lose, or damage any physical or mental functions, which result in a disturbance to their daily life or activities, such as physical, visual, hearing, intellectual impairments, mental disorders and any other types of disabilities toward the insurmountable end of the scale." In short, persons with disabilities are those whose abilities have been reduced due to physical, mental, or sensory impairment.

The rights of persons with disabilities to education are protected and materialized through other legal instruments including the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, the Constitution of Cambodia, and Cambodia's Law on the Protection and the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Persons with disabilities have been promoted through various policies, including the National Strategy on Persons with Disabilities 2019-2023. Related to the promotion of the education of persons with disabilities in Cambodia, special education has been the focus of the Government of Cambodia through the adoption of the Policy on Education for Children with Disabilities in 2008 which was revised as the Policy on Inclusive Education by the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport (MoEYS) in 2018.

The outbreak of the Covid-19 pandemic since early 2020 in Cambodia caused a public health crisis and consequently led to social and economic difficulties for individuals, businesses, and government. The pandemic especially affected persons with disabilities as it jeopardized their employment, travel restrictions made it even more difficult for them to access services, and other Covid-19 pandemic preventive measures put them at risk of social isolation. Covid-19 has also impacted education on many fronts, challenging achievement of the Sustainable Development

¹ National Institute of Statistics, Ministry of Planning, Census of the population in the Kingdom of Cambodia 2019, National Report on Final Results, October 2020, page 125.

² See ILO Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment (Disabled Persons) Convention (No. 159), 1983; UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with disabilities, adopted on 03 July 2009; and Cambodia's Law on the Protection and the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities dated 03 July 2009.

³ UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with disabilities, adopted on 03 July 2009, Article 1, paragraph 2.

⁴ Cambodia's Law on the Protection and the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities promulgated in 03 July 2009, Article 4.

Goal 4. The MoEYS decided to close all educational institutions, including all public and private schools, on March 16, 2020. School closures have resulted in the disruption of learning in all of Cambodia's 13,482 schools, affecting 3,210,285 students of which half are female, and 93,225 teachers (MoEYS, 2021). Within the education sector, students with disabilities are found to be even more severely impacted by the pandemic both in terms of living situation and their learning opportunities.

This study examines the impacts of the Covid-19 pandemic on the education of students with disabilities, reviews related laws and policies, and identifies strategies to respond to the pandemic. A combination of qualitative interviews and findings from reports and academic journals are discussed. The study also puts forth recommendations.

2. Research Objectives and Questions

There have been several discussions on the social and economic consequences of Covid-19 on persons with disabilities in Cambodia; however, less research has been conducted to provide concrete evidence of the impacts and very few studies have provided policy recommendations to cope with the adverse social and economic effects. Therefore, the objectives of this study are:

- 1. To review current Cambodia's laws and policies related to the rights of persons with disabilities, in particular the right to education;
- 2. To review legal frameworks and/or interventions related to the rights to education of persons with disabilities in selected foreign countries in ASEAN, Australia, etc. in the Covid-19 period;
- 3. To examine the responses of the government of Cambodia in promoting the rights to education of people with disabilities during the Covid-19 era;
- 4. To explore the impacts of Covid-19 on persons with disabilities, especially those in special education in Cambodia; and
- 5. To propose recommendations to support persons with disabilities in future crises.

The study sets out the following research questions:

- 1. What are Cambodia's current laws and policies related to the rights of persons with disabilities and regarding special education in Cambodia?
- 2. What are the frameworks, responses, and/or lessons learned from other countries with regard to the law and policy implications and best practices that could support persons with disabilities in Cambodia and ease its adverse effects?
- 3. What was the government of Cambodia's response to help persons with disabilities during Covid-19?
- 4. What are the impacts of Covid-19 on persons with disabilities, specifically students in Cambodia?

3. Research methodology, scope and contribution of the study

This study undertook desk reviews, secondary data analysis, and qualitative interviews. The research team reviewed laws, policies, and existing reports on the social and economic impacts of Covid-19 on peoples with disabilities in Cambodia. The team also reviewed published articles, journal articles and grey literature, websites, and reports, related to the impacts of Covid-19 on students with disabilities both in Cambodia and in other countries. A workshop was organized to verify the results with relevant stakeholders.

Interviews were conducted with students, teachers, staff, and management to explore the challenges they faced during the pandemic. The study also conducted key informant interviews and/or group discussions with school management members. Phone call interviews were conducted with students' parents. A total of 9 school management team members, 22 teachers, 35 students with hearing difficulties, 33 students with visual impairments, and 10 parents of students with disabilities were interviewed.

Data analysis used qualitative analysis to categorize the interviews into themes or types of impacts. The findings were also discussed with the existing literature on the impact of Covid-19 on students with disabilities to compare and confirm the differences and similarities of the Cambodian case.

Disabilities come in various types. This study covers only two types – hard of hearing⁵ or deaf students and visually impaired or blind⁶ students at the selected schools that provide special education and training to only students with the two types of disabilities.

The study contributes to academia and policy-making domains. Specifically, since this study focuses on students with disabilities, this study significantly contributes to the special education sector, which is one of the main priority areas of the Royal Government of Cambodia.

4. Reviews of Related Laws, Policies and Frameworks on People with Disabilities in Cambodia

4.1 The Constitution of Cambodia

The right to education is guaranteed in the Constitution of Cambodia of 1993. The Constitution, in particular Article 48, reads "The State shall protect the rights of the children as stipulated in the Convention on Children, particular, the right to life, education, protection during wartime, and from economic or sexual exploitation... The State shall protect children from acts that are injurious to their education opportunities, health and welfare." The concept of education for all is also found in the supreme law. For example, Article 65 reads "The State shall protect and upgrade citizens"

⁵ Hard of hearing refers to a hearing loss where there may be enough residual hearing that an auditory device, such as a hearing aid or FM system, provides adequate assistance to process speech.

⁶ Visual impairments include low vision and blindness and refer to any degree of impairment to a person's ability to see that affects his or her daily life.

rights to quality education at all levels and shall take necessary steps for quality education to reach all citizens..." Furthermore, Article 66 stipulates that "The state shall establish a comprehensive and standardized educational system throughout the country that shall guarantee the principles of educational freedom and quality to ensure that all citizens have equal opportunity to earn a living." The Constitution, Article 68, requires that the State provides free primary and secondary education to all citizens in public schools and citizens must receive education for at least nine years.

4.2 Law on Education 2007

The education of persons with disabilities had not been stated in the law until the adoption of the Law on Education which was promulgated in 2007. The Law on Education reaffirms the guarantee of the provision of education for all persons and introduces the provision of the education of persons with disabilities. The Law on Education, Article 31 stipulates that "Every citizen has the right to access qualitative education of at least 9 years in public school free of charge. The Ministry in charge of education shall gradually prepare the policy and strategic plans to ensure that all citizens obtain quality education as stipulated by this law." Education of persons with disabilities falls under the special education of the Law on Education. Article 38 of the same law reads "The state encourages and promotes to have special education for disabled persons and outstanding learners who are gifted and/or talented... Special education provided for outstanding learners appropriate to their intelligence and talent and provided a suitable education for disabled persons... Special education programs shall be formulated by Prakas of the Ministry in charge of Education."

Under the Law on Education, in the context of special education, a person with disabilities is called a disabled learner which refers to those who need facilitation or support for their education. They are learners who are disabled with either one or two of their legs, deaf, mute, blind in both of their eyes, or have mental disabilities. Under this law, the definition of disabled learners is not defined in the main text of the law. It is defined in the glossary which is attached as an annex.

Furthermore, the Law on Education, Article 39, has listed the rights of disabled learners or persons with disabilities as follows:

"Disabled learners have the same rights as able learners and have separate special rights as follows:

⁷ Pursuant to glossary annexed to Law on Education 2007, qualitative education refers to a type of education which fulfills the needs for basic and continuing education for the whole lives of the learners.

⁸ Pursuant to glossary annexed to Law on Education 2007, special education refers to education and training for any person who has special needs such as disabled learners.

- Disabled learners of either sex have the right to study with able learners if there is sufficient facilitation in the study process for the disabled learners to fulfill the educational program of the educational institutions;
- Disabled learners with special needs have the right to receive additional teaching in the regular educational program, which is not a particularly special educational program;
- Disabled learners who are not able to learn with able learners have the right to receive special education in separate special classes. These disabled learners can study at community schools in their locality."

According to the said Article 39 of the Law on Education, there are three main special rights of disabled learners in education. The first right of disabled learners aims to include and allow disabled learners to participate in educational institutions where able learners are studying. In realizing this right, there must be sufficient support and facilitation in the study process for the disabled learner to fulfill the educational program requirements of the said educational institution. The second right of disabled learners also aims to allow them to participate in the study process with the able learners. In realizing this inclusion, additional teaching under the regular educational program will be given to disabled learners who require special support. The third right of disabled learners aims to provide special education in a separate special class. The disabled learners will not participate in ordinary classrooms with able learners since special educational programs will be designed to provide education with quality to disabled learners. It is reasonable in the cases where the inclusion of disabled learners in the ordinary classroom of ordinary educational program will not provide education with quality. Hence, disabled learners and able learners should be separated; and special educational program should be given to disabled learners.

4.3 Law on the Protection and the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities 2009

Two years after the promulgation of the Law on Education in 2007, the Law on the Protection and the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities was promulgated in 2009. If comparing the latter with the former, the latter provides more details on the right to education of persons with disabilities. If compared to the Law on Education, the Law on the Protection and the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities seems to provide a definition of persons with disabilities in a broader sense. Article 4 of this Law reads "...Persons with disabilities: refers to any persons who lack, lose, or damage any physical or mental functions, which result in a disturbance to their daily life or activities, such as physical, visual, hearing, intellectual impairments, mental disorders and any other types of disabilities toward the insurmountable end of the scale...". Under the same law, all pupils and students with disabilities are entitled to enrolment in public and private educational institutions and to scholarships. The government is required to develop policies and national strategies for the education of pupils and students with disabilities in order to promote inclusive education for pupils and students with disabilities to the maximum extent possible and

_

⁹ Law on the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, Article. 27.

to establish special classes to fit the needs of the pupils and students with disabilities. ¹⁰ Pursuant to Article 29 of the same law, the Ministry in charge of education is also required to develop programs for educational institutions to provide accessible facilities for pupils and students with disabilities regarding the following:

- buildings, classrooms and study places;
- sign language and Braille;
- educational techniques and pedagogy corresponding to the types of disabilities;
- study materials or other equipment to assist pupils and students with disabilities;
- training and teaching materials for teachers or professors and others corresponding to the actual needs of each pupil and student with disabilities.

Furthermore, the Ministry in charge of Education must pay special attention to the educational needs of pupils and students with disabilities. Pupils and students with disabilities in poor families or military veterans with disabilities have the right to receive free education at public educational establishments at all levels and have access to study books and materials. Additionally, private educational establishments have the obligation to provide a special discount for school fees, textbooks, and stationery for pupils and students with disabilities or military veterans with disabilities. The discount on school fees and stationery in private educational establishments will be determined by an inter-ministerial Prakas by the Ministers in charge of Social Affairs and Education. However, as of now, it is unknown whether there is such a Prakas. If there is no such Prakas, the rights of the pupils and students with disabilities will not be fulfilled.

Regarding the method and content of teaching to pupils and students with disabilities, the same law further requires the Ministry in charge of education to include sensitization to the causes of disabilities, disability prevention, and the value of persons with disabilities in the mainstream of education programs. It also requires pedagogical programs to train teachers and professors to develop their knowledge on disabilities and teaching methodology on teaching pupils and students with disabilities.¹² The same law further requires the Ministry in charge of information to disseminate information free of charge through state-run media to raise public awareness about disabilities and the rights of persons with disabilities in order to promote solidarity, understanding, and implementation of the rights of persons with disabilities. The private media networks must implement special programs contributing actively to the above activities. ¹³

¹⁰ Law on the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, Article. 28

¹¹ Law on the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, Article. 30.

¹² Law on the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, Article. 31.

¹³ Law on the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, Article. 32.

4.4 Cambodia Sustainable Development Goal (CSDG)

Cambodia has signed on to the United Nations Sustainable Development Goal with country-specific targets. For Sustainable Development Goal No. 4- Quality Education: Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all, Cambodia's targets are:

- **4.1** By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and Goal-4 effective learning outcomes.
- **4.2** By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and preprimary education so that they are ready for primary education.
- **4.3** By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable and quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university.
- **4.4** By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship.
- **4.5** By 2030, eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations.
- **4.6** By 2030, ensure that all youth and a substantial proportion of adults, both men and women, achieve literacy and numeracy.
- **4.7** By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development.
- **4.A** Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, nonviolent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all.
- **4.B** By 2020, substantially expand globally the number of scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training and information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes, in developed countries and other developing countries.

4.C By 2030, substantially increase the supply of qualified teachers, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing states.

4.5 Rectangular Strategy of the Royal Government of Cambodia

The Rectangular Strategy Phase III states the government's commitment to "...Further implementing the national policy on disability through the Disability Action Council; strengthening the implementation of the Law on the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, and promoting the enhancement of rights and welfare of the disabled according to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, as well as improving the quality and efficiency of the disability fund's services"

4.6 The National Disability Strategic Plan (NDSP) 2014-2018

The National Disability Strategic Plan (NDSP) 2014-2018 outlines key strategic objectives and focuses on the reduction of poverty for persons with disabilities; provision of quality and equal health services as well as physical and mental rehabilitation; provision of access to justice and prevention from discrimination, abuse, mistreatment and exploitation of persons with disabilities; access to education and participation in expressing their voices; access to information and participation in political and development work; and facilitation for access to the physical environment, public transport and facilities, knowledge, information and communication; assurance of gender equality and promotion of capacity for women and children with disabilities; enhancement and expansion of international cooperation. The NDSP sets out ten strategies including 1) Increase primary and secondary education enrolment rates of children with disabilities; 2) Develop and increase study materials including Braille in formats that are readily accessible for children with disabilities; 3) Enhance teaching of life and social development skills to facilitate persons with disabilities full and equal participation in education and as members of the community; 4) Promote education for persons with disabilities particularly children who are blind, deaf or deaf blind, is delivered in the most appropriate languages and modes and means of communication for the individual, and in environments which maximize academic and social development; 5) Increase and encourage number of teachers that are employed, including teachers with disabilities, who are qualified in sign language and/or Braille, and to train professionals and staff who work at all levels of education; 6) Promote persons with disabilities to access general tertiary education, vocational training, adult education and lifelong learning without discrimination and on an equal basis with others; 7) Promote reasonable accommodation for persons with disabilities to access quality education; 8) Promote integration in teaching curriculum content, lessons and positive attitudes and actions towards persons with disabilities in preschool, primary and secondary education; 9) Increase the number of scholarship opportunities for students with disabilities to continue their education at tertiary levels of education; and 10) Provide opportunities to develop and utilize persons with disabilities creative, artistic and intellectual potential, not only for their own benefit, but also for the enrichment of society. Responsible institutions are the MoEYS; the Ministry of Economy and Finance; the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth

Rehabilitation; the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training; the Ministry of Land Management, Urban Planning and Construction; the Disability Action Council; development partners, national and international non-governmental organizations, and self-help groups; and all relevant ministries and institutions.

4.7 Policy on Inclusive Education by the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport in 2018

The Policy on Inclusive Education was issued in 2018 by the MoEYS. It envisions that all persons with special needs have the right to inclusive and equitable quality education and opportunities for life-long learning. The goal of the Policy on Inclusive Education is to educate all persons with special needs to have the knowledge, skills, and attitude necessary so that they are able to contribute to the development of society. The policy has the following objectives:

- To ensure early identification, assessment and timely intervention;
- To provide access to inclusive and equitable quality education and life-long learning opportunities;
- To build capacity and enhance professional development for all teachers as well as school management; and
- To raise awareness and promote participation.

More specifically, providing access to inclusive and equitable quality education includes:

- Ensuring the provision of school registration services for learners with special needs and enable them to receive appropriate education;
- Ensuring that the national curriculum and textbooks respond to the di- verse needs of all learners with special needs;
- Ensuring that special education program is compatible with the national curriculum and that textbooks are available for use in all public and private educational institutions;
- Developing inclusive education program for learners who have intellectual disability;
- Introduce flexible teaching methodologies in the national curriculum that are student-centered, participatory pedagogy and culturally appropriate;
- Providing adequate teaching and learning materials to meet individual needs of all learners with special educational needs;
- Developing Individual Education Plans for all persons with special needs by identifying their learning or needs;
- Encouraging and supporting educational research activities of all persons with special needs;
- Developing a fair and flexible assessment to enable all persons with special needs to participate in the exam and provide them with "reasonable accommodation";

- Developing Integrated Classes in all study grade levels to provide age-appropriate learning for all persons with special needs;
- Developing social assistance schemes to support persons with special needs;
- Including learners and university students with special needs into inclusive classes where possible;
- Introducing sporting services, arts, and other services appropriate to the needs of learners with special needs.

4.8 Cambodia Education Response Plan to COVID-19 Pandemic

The MoEYS issued Cambodia's Education Response Plan to the COVID-19 Pandemic in 2020. Based on the plan, a COVID-19 mapping exercise was regularly carried out through the Education Sector Working Group (ESWG) and NGO partners to collect information on key activities being supported by development partners and NGOs in response to the outbreak in Cambodia. The mapping document has been updated periodically to support timely information sharing among MoEYS, ESWG members, and NGOs.

In early 2020, MoEYS sent out a letter to schools notifying them about the threat of COVID-19 and urging the adoption of good hygiene practice in schools. In mid-March, MoEYS closed schools in Siem Reap and Phnom Penh, and later called for a closure for all schools and education institutions across the country until further notice. The Ministry also subsequently announced teleworking arrangements for all education personnel. In April, MoEYS issued a directive on the implementation of distance learning and e-learning programmes at pre-primary, primary, and secondary education levels. Complementary to this directive, MoEYS developed an operational guideline to support the implementation of distance learning in pre-schools, primary schools, secondary general education schools, and targeted higher education institutions.

In early June, MoEYS issued guidelines on e-learning programs at teacher training institutions. The guidelines set out principles, measures, and necessary steps for all teacher training institutions to provide training and capacity development to teacher trainees, teacher educators, and management teams. The core strategic component of the MoEYS COVID-19 response was to develop distance learning services for children from early childhood education (ECE) through to secondary education. Expanding online learning for all children across different education levels continued over the coming months.

In March 2020, MoEYS began to prepare online lessons for Grade 9 and 12 students, as students in these grades have annual national examinations. Noting the extended school closures and the importance of supporting learning for all children (not just Grades 9 and 12), MoEYS developed distance learning content to reach students from ECE to Grade 12, including those from ethnic minority communities and children with hearing difficulties. These programmes could be accessed through Facebook and YouTube, and MoEYS also developed a U-Learning platform. With support from a variety of development partners, MoEYS broadcasted distance learning programmes

through a new dedicated education television channel (TVK2) and through the radio. The TVK2 channel broadcasted content relevant to preschoolers through to upper secondary students, while the current radio programmes focus on reaching parents and children engaged in pre-school and mid-level education (MLE), and students in pre-school and Grades 1–3.

For special education, efforts have been made to integrate Cambodian Sign Language into primary and secondary online and television e-lessons to enhance inclusivity. As of June 26, 2020, a total of 1,618 assets from ECE to Grade 12 had been produced, including 1,303 e-learning videos, of which 219 were integrated with sign language and 30 were converted and printed in braille; and 270 MLE radio spots were developed in three languages. Of the learning assets, 551 have been broadcast across various social media platforms, radio, or other mentioned channels.

Key strategies to promote the accessibility and inclusion of children with disabilities in the education response were prioritized. Some actions include: (i) sign language and subtitles for video content for children with hearing impairments; (ii) radio programmes for children with visual impairments; (iii) provision of learning devices/equipment and connectivity; and (iv) print media in braille for children with visual impairments. In addition to parents' efforts to support their children in distance learning, teachers also play a critical role in deepening the impact of continuous or distance learning programmes in Cambodia's COVID-19 response and recovery context. Strategies practiced in Cambodia in inclusive education include:

- Inclusive learning materials (paper-based and digital materials, integration of sign language for online learning assets);
- Assistive devices that support learning and mobilities of children with disabilities;
- Pre-service teacher training offered through distance and online sessions;
- Partnerships with NGOs providing home-based education for children with disabilities;
- Developing video clips for parents/caregivers to engage and play with their children with disabilities;
- Provision of Hygiene and Sanitation supplies to prepare for safe schools reopening;
- MoEYS issued guidelines around distance learning, home-based and small group learning, and remedial teaching.

To implement the strategies and practices in inclusive education, the MoEYS conducted the follow key activities:

- Up-skilling: developing digital literacy learning
- Mitigate learning loss: implement the adapted remedial program in special education schools
- Provision supplies: source audio-visual equipment, power supply for remote schools, and easy-read printed materials

- Support ongoing Teachers' Capacity building on inclusive education: Pre-service and In-service trainings
- Safety measures: Continued health preventive measures and practices.

5. ASEAN Frameworks Related to Persons with Disabilities and COVID-19 Responses

5.1 ASEAN Enabling Master Plan 2025: Mainstreaming the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

The Association of South East Asian Nations (ASEAN) Enabling Masterplan 2025 seeks to complement the ASEAN Community Vision 2025 in mainstreaming the rights of persons with disabilities across all pillars of the ASEAN Community and to foster Member States' commitment towards an inclusive community. It is guided by the underlying principles that for all actions concerning persons with disabilities whether undertaken by individuals, public or private social welfare institutions, courts of law, administrative authorities or legislative bodies or entities, their interests and needs must be taken into consideration, acknowledging that inclusion and mainstreaming should be promoted, and specialized approaches considered as a last resort. Additionally, the Enabling Masterplan serves as a key instrument in steering its policies and programs to be inclusive for persons with disabilities.

5.2 Bali Declaration on the Enhancement of The Role and Participation of the Persons with Disabilities in ASEAN Community and Mobilization Framework of the ASEAN Decade of Persons with Disabilities (2011-2020).

ASEAN Leaders, as the representatives of ASEAN Member States and its people, proclaimed the ASEAN Decade of Persons with Disabilities (2011-2020) as the thematic years to promote disability inclusive development in ASEAN and to reaffirm ASEAN's commitment toward equal rights and opportunities of persons with disabilities in all spheres of ASEAN society. In line with disability related documents, particularly the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD), fifteen major priority areas were set and aligned with each of the ASEAN's pillars, depicting that disability is a cross-cutting issue embedded in all of the work of the ASEAN Community. In respect of established sectoral bodies, mechanisms, and protocol, the Decade intent was to promote implementation of disability initiatives by utilizing those existing mechanisms and bodies in addition to welcoming other initiatives which enhance the overall quality of life development of person with disabilities in ASEAN. The Fundamental Principles of the Decade of the Mobilization Framework are:

- Respect in the identity and unique characteristics of ASEAN Community, particularly for established sectoral bodies, mechanisms, and protocol.

- Realization of disability as a cross-sectoral issue embedded within three pillars of the ASEAN Community: ASEAN Political-Security Community (APSC), ASEAN Economic Community (AEC), and ASEAN Socio-Cultural Community (ASCC).
- Encouragement for ASEAN Member States and ASEAN Secretariat to share the ownership of "the ASEAN Decade of Persons with Disabilities (2011-2020)" and related initiatives to fully promote rights and equal opportunity of persons with disabilities at the national and regional level.
- Respect in the joint effort of multi-stakeholders, including persons with disabilities and their families, Disabled Persons Organizations (DPOs), CSOs, and international organizations, academic institutions, business sector, other related entities towards empowerment and quality of life development of persons with disabilities.
- Promotion of people-oriented mechanisms and policies and inclusion of persons with disabilities in the policy formulation process, including recognition of the ASEAN Disability Forum (ADF) as the voice from the disability community, providing the platform of action for mainstreaming disability perspectives in the ASEAN community.

In the declaration and framework, Priority Area 9 focuses specifically on children with disabilities action, including:

- Ensuring that children with disabilities are provided with disability and age appropriate programs/services;
- Ensuring that all actions concerning children with disabilities, in the best interests of children, will be a primary consideration;
- Ensuring inclusion of children with disabilities in ASEAN's existing programs/ initiatives for children such as ASEAN Children's Forum (ACF) and address children with disabilities issues in ASEAN's related bodies

6.3 ASEAN Comprehensive Recovery Framework

In response to the COVID-19 pandemic, the recovery framework was developed at the 36th ASEAN Summit in June 2020. It serves as the main reference document for strategic direction, partnerships, areas of focus, and coordination of support for recovery for internal and external ASEAN stakeholders. Its members consider the framework to be a collective and long-term socioeconomic recovery strategy guided by key principles, a targeted approach, and a results-based plan. The guiding principles of the ASEAN Comprehensive Recovery Framework (ACRF) are: 1) Focused by prioritizing broad strategies and key priorities that are most relevant to support ASEAN's recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic; 2) Balanced between saving lives and livelihoods. Economic recovery should not come at the expense of public health, equity, security, and long-term sustainability; 3) Impactful strategies and priorities that will go beyond high-level statements and that deliver sustainable results and meet stakeholders' expectations; 4) Pragmatic

by aligning with existing plans and leveraging existing ASEAN mechanisms, initiatives, cooperation programmes, and partners; 5) Inclusive in both the design and implementation of actions to decrease inequality, paying special attention to vulnerable groups and sectors, which are the worst affected by the pandemic. All segments of society should benefit, so no one is left behind in ASEAN recovery efforts; and 6) Measurable implementation of ACRF should be ensured, and progress monitored and periodically assessed.

6.4 Declaration on the Digital Transformation of the Education System in ASEAN

The Declaration on the Digital Transformation of the Education System in ASEAN includes the key focus on fostering digital literacy and developing transferable skills, promoting access to safe digital learning opportunities for all, engaging the private sector including in the provision of innovative digital learning solutions, and collaborating with stakeholders on open education resources and open access learning. The adoption and eventual implementation of the abovementioned declaration will drive the comprehensive transformation of ASEAN Member States' education systems and contribute to increasing access and inclusiveness to quality education and enhance the resilience of ASEAN education systems to future pandemics, shocks, and disruptions.

Taking its foundations from the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD), ASEAN Community Vision 2025, and the ASEAN Comprehensive Recovery Framework (ACRF), this report presents current practices of inclusive education in Brunei Darussalam, Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao People's Democratic Republic (PDR), Malaysia, Myanmar, the Philippines, Singapore, Thailand, and Viet Nam from ASEAN, and in China and Mongolia. The seven domains of inclusive education as described in UNICEF's Education for Every Ability (2020) anchor the country profiles. Students with disabilities not only can help the economy grow across ASEAN but also contribute to the diversity of work in the public and private sectors, and foster morale, creativity, and greater social cohesion.

6. Reviews of Policies and Responses Related to COVID-19 on Persons with Disabilities of Australia

6.1 The Australian Human Rights Commission Act 1986

The Australian Human Rights Commission Act 1986 establishes the Australian Human Rights Commission which is a government body overseeing the application of federal legislation in the areas of human rights, anti-discrimination, social justice and privacy. The Commission's website (https://humanrights.gov.au) also provides links and information on relevant disability and human rights conventions and standards. Since the outbreak of Covid-19 in 2020, the Commission has provided advice directly to the federal government, various committees, and key organizations to ensure measures to combat COVID-19 protect peoples' human rights now and advance them in

the recovery phase.¹⁴ The Commission has developed reports on COVID-19 human rights related issues, including:

- Management of Covid-19 risks in immigration detention (2021);
- Guideline on the rights of people with disabilities in health and disability care during COVID-19 (2020);
- Impacts of COVID-19 on children and young people who contact Kids Helpline.

The Guideline on the Rights of People with Disabilities in Health and Disability Dare during COVID-19 (2020) provides practical guidance on how to apply a human rights-based approach to decision-making within the health system in the context of the current pandemic, that takes the rights of people with disability properly into account. Healthcare and disability support providers can use these Guidelines as the basis for developing publicly available medical and treatment protocols which uphold the human rights principles outlined.

6.2 Australian Government Preparedness and Responses to COVID-19

In order to prepare for and respond to COVID-19 and provide support to persons with disabilities, Australia established a Disability Taskforce immediately to bring together representatives from disabled people's organizations, disability advocacy and representative organizations, the disability service system, representatives from health and education, and other relevant stakeholders. Australia issued preparedness and response strategies to support people and children with disabilities, including providing for their immediate welfare by ensuring the continuity of support, both and via the National Disability Insurance Scheme (NDIS); expanding existing national information services to manage requests related to COVID-19 from people with disabilities, particularly those who may not have access to the internet; and providing resources and establishing a proactive, phone-based outreach program to existing NDAP providers to enable advocates to connect and check in with people with disabilities. This program actively engaged with any other person with disabilities in the region that the NDAP provider operates; establishing a national prioritized delivery service for essential goods for people with disabilities such as sanitizing equipment, continence aids, and medical consumables (e.g. medical swabs, feeding support, catheters, wound dressings); actively liaising with states and territories to ensure full inclusion of people with disabilities in all plans to deal with COVID-19; providing equal access to essential goods, such as groceries and food; and ensuring that all information provided was available in plain English, Easy Read, and Auslan, and that departments liaised with disability organizations about vital communications before the information was sent out or posted to ensure that it was disability friendly and accessible.

The committee is also obligated to provide support by ensuring people with disabilities, both who contract COVID-19 and those who do not, are provided essential support and services from providers (especially accommodation providers) at all times, by providing additional financial

17

 $^{^{14}} Available \ at \ \underline{https://humanrights.gov.au/our-work/commission-general/covid-19-information?} \ ga=2.128564044.1339008180.1680104714-460255665.1679915031, last visit on 29 March 2023.$

support where needed. This was established through an emergency COVID-19 NDIS response to ensure that people with disabilities could more flexibly utilize their plans, to get information to people with disabilities, and to ensure continuity of support. Specifically, continuity of support for people with disabilities included the provisions for replacement of support workers at no financial penalty, planning to manage support provisions if a person with disabilities contracts COVID-19; planning to manage support provisions if disability support workers contract COVID-19, etc.

For the many people with disabilities not on the NDIS, the Australian government created a mainstream state/territory response team who are responsible for ensuring providers maintain capacity to continue the provision of services and support provision. Where appropriate, the response team could facilitate support and referral pathways, information and resources from other government agencies, and expansion of Home and Community Care services by states and territories.

The committee also worked to provide employment and income support by providing accessible facilities for the many people with disabilities who needed to work from home to ensure equal access to work; ensuring people with disabilities who needed to self-isolate would not be discriminated against by their employers; ensuring access to special leave for people with disabilities who don't have COVID-19 but still need to self-isolate when they are not able to work from home and/or if they didn't have other leave provisions available to them; and suspended all in-person mutual obligation requirements on Newstart and other income support payments, such as the Disability Support Pension. People who were applying for income support payments because they were not able to work were entitled to timely review of their application.

Specifically for education, the committee allowed people with disabilities who were studying to access their course work from home, including flexible arrangements for accessing course material and assessments, no penalty for needed flexible arrangements, ensuring equal access to all school materials if students with disabilities were required to study from home, ensuring there were plans to support University and technical and further education (TAFE) students with disabilities in the case of shut downs, ensuring there was clear communication with families about what was happening including what to do about keeping children and young people with disabilities safe, and ensuring there were clear plans for families of children with disabilities if schools and early childhood services were shut down including making reasonable adjustments for children and students with disabilities if their education was to continue at home.

For children and young people with disabilities, the Australian government ensured flexibility in NDIS as NDIS plans often did not include support worker time and this was essential as children's services closed. They also established a plan for children and young people with disabilities that spans employment of families of children and young people with disabilities, NDIS, Health, Education, and that took an intersectional approach (CALD, First Nations, rural and remote issues

etc.). They established a central coordinating taskforce specifically for children and young people with disabilities aged 0-25, in partnership with disability advocacy organisations, to oversee the response and established strong communications targeted at this cohort and tailored to their needs, in consultation with disability advocates. Actions included boosting funding for advocacy organisations that work with children and young people with disabilities, noting NDAP does not fund many organisations that provide specialist support for children and young people and that these are mainly funded by states and territories and were overwhelmed with demand, even before the crisis.

Specific to the deafblind community and heard of hearing community, the government took into account the communities' specific communications needs. Information needed to be in a range of formats, including Auslan, tactile interpreting, captioning, large print, braille, electronic, etc. and required messaging on all television media with closed captioning.

The Australian Government committed to ensuring that every student, including students with disabilities, have access to education in a sustainable and effective manner during the COVID-19 pandemic. Importantly, through the National Principles for School Education, all government and non-government schools, including special schools, were encouraged to continue to provide an oncampus option for those children who were not able to learn at home, including vulnerable children, children with disabilities, and the children of essential workers. Guidance for school leaders about how to do this, whilst minimizing the relatively low risk of transmission of COVID-19 in schools, was provided by the Australian Health Protection Principal Committee.

The decision on whether students who are medically vulnerable or have additional support needed attend school was recommended to be determined in consultation with the principal, the parent/caretaker, and the student's medical practitioner where appropriate. The Department of Health published the Return to School for Students with Disability COVID-19 Health Risk Management Plan to assist with this decision.

7. Findings: Impacts of COVID-19 on Students with Disabilities

According to the MoEYS, full statistics and data on people with disabilities are not readily available in Cambodia. For children with disabilities, access to school and the possibility of staying in school is far lower than for children without disabilities. According to the Education Management Information System (EMIS), in school year 2019/20, an estimated 891 preschoolaged children with disabilities enrolled in preschool, of which 377 were girls. Furthermore, 11,934 children with a disabilities enrolled in primary school, of which 4,906 were girls. Data from the UNESCO Institute for Statistics 2018 on educational disparities linked to disability show that 73 percent of Cambodian 14 to 16-year-olds without a disability have completed primary education, compared to only 44 per cent of their peers with a disability. The study showed a large gap between

children with and without disabilities, with a 50-percentage point difference between the out-of-school rate of disabled and non-disabled children (57 percent vs. 7 percent, respectively). This was also reflected in the adjusted disability parity index of 1.88, which means that children with disabilities are almost two times more likely to be out of school than their non-disabled peers in Cambodia. A blog post by the Global Partnership for Education summarized some of the challenges that children with disabilities faced during the pandemic. These include the observation that: remote learning tools are not always accessible to learners with disabilities or those with complex learning needs; limited internet hinders learning even further; and lack of additional support and care (such as therapy, related care services, education support, etc.) impacts children with disabilities.

Students with visual and auditory disabilities were impacted by the changes to their learning environment. All schools were closed after the outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic, and a few months later, online learning modes were introduced. The MoEYS introduced TV programs and video clips to assist students with learning. In addition, teachers were encouraged to produce short videos to send to students. The delivery modes of teaching or communication between the teachers and students were done via Facebook Messenger and Telegram. Teachers sent video clips and study materials to students using the two apps. Based on the interviews with students, teachers, and the school management, these materials did not cater to the special needs of disabled students.

Instructions from the MoEYS during the school closures were very general. There were no specific instructions for dealing with students with disabilities. When asked to describe the situation at the National Institute for Special Education (NISE) during the Covid-19 outbreak, the director of NISE mentioned that there was no specific instruction for NISE; however, NISE followed the government's instructions for normal high schools such as social distancing and improving hygiene among students. He also added that all the staff members and trainers were required to wear masks all the time for protective measures.

There was very little support for students' living and learning. When asked if there was any support provided to help students learn during the COVID-19 pandemic, one of the teachers mentioned that during the pandemic, the MoEYS required that teaching and learning be conducted virtually and all the teachers were trained virtually on methodology for online teaching and how to motivate students to continue learning via online platform. However, most of the teachers accepted that the training was not enough to help them teach online effectively, especially on how to use online teaching platforms. One teacher claimed that there was no proper training on how to use the Zoom platform, and they had to figure out how to use it by themselves. She added that it was very challenging as most of the teachers were not familiar with the platform and there was no technical support within the school.

Another teacher mentioned that there were a few organizations that provided tablets and laptops for teachers and students to borrow. She added that one laptop/tablet was shared among two teachers. For students, if they did not have one, they had to make a request to the office. However, only the students living near the school were able to borrow from the office, while those living far away were not able to do so. One of the teachers claimed that those devices were quite old. She was worried that the device would be damaged and she would have to pay for such an old device. Most of the teachers interviewed claimed that they need regular training on using various technology for teaching and learning and necessary devices. This would make them more prepared if they were to teach online again. A teacher claimed that ad hoc training would never be effective.

7.1 Impacts of COVID-19 on Students' Emotion and Wellbeing

Visually impaired students and hard of hearing students felt that it was harder for them to move during social distancing and restrictions. This also caused negative impacts on their physical and mental health.¹⁵ There were also noted differences between students with different types of disabilities.

Social distancing made it very challenging for visually impaired students as they need certain services for their movement. During the COVID-19 restrictions, students with visual impairment found it extremely difficult to navigate.

"As touching is almost the only way for me to move and feel things, when the government imposed social distancing measure, I found it very difficult to navigate around and perform daily necessities." Said a blind teacher trainee at the NISE.

Hard of hearing students also found it difficult to navigate to work or to get necessities. Because communication required sign language, hard of hearing students/teacher trainees felt that it was harder to move around for them than for normal people.

"Even though I could see, it was so difficult to get food. I was restricted from moving. I was trying to explain to the authorities about my purpose of travel, but they did not understand my sign language. They did not allow me to pass." Said a deaf teacher trainee at the NISE.

Children are not indifferent to the significant psychological impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. They experience fear, uncertainties, substantial changes to their routines, physical and social isolation, alongside high levels of parental stress. ¹⁶ Social distancing or social isolation has led to a lack of daily routine and structure. Maintaining a routine induces a sense of discipline as well as safety in children, which is important for their psychological and emotional development. Adjusting routines, like, experiencing closure of schools and day care centers, social distancing

-

¹⁵ See Abour-Nicitopoulos, et.al (2022). Movement Behaviour and health of children and youth with disabilities: Impact of 2020 COVID-19 pandemic

¹⁶ See Imran, et al., 2020

and/or confinement to home, can prove to be a real struggle for children with physical and mental disabilities.¹⁷ The findings from the interviews with students from special education high schools found that both visually and auditory impaired students were found to have been emotionally affected from the school closures and the COVID-19 pandemic. When the students were asked to stay at home and adhere to social distancing, they got bored as they missed their friends, their activities, and their teachers. For some students with hearing difficulties, their family members were not able to communicate using sign language so this increased their isolation.

"I was extremely bored when I had to stay at home as I miss my friends at school where we could communicate with each other. At home I felt I was being left behind as my family members did not pay attention to me. They cannot use sign language," Said a deaf student at Battambang High School for Special Education.

In addition, because of their limited understanding of the event, both visually impaired students and students with hearing difficulties experienced worry and stress. When asked about the difficulties they experienced during the Covid-19 pandemic, the students claimed that they were afraid of getting infected and they were scared of contacting other people or their friends.

"During COVID-19, I was so worried that I would be infected by the virus as I could not see anything besides being told by other people about the situation," said a visually impaired teacher trainee at NISE.

Moreover, special education schools offer accommodation and food to students from remote areas and students who need support. Schools provided three meals per day to students staying in school and one meal to those not staying in school. Learning from home means their family had to take care of their meals, which is quite a constraint for the poorer families. One of the students mentioned that "I prefer to learn at school because my family is poor, and I do not have enough food to eat." Some other students became depressed as the learning environment at home is less fun that that at school. One student stated that "I was so stressed when learning online and I wanted to return to school so that I can see my friends."

Experiencing negative emotions, changes in moods, and changes in the sleeping and eating patterns of children put them at a greater risk of experiencing relapse of mental illness as well as exacerbating existing mental health issues. The pandemic also exacerbated the emotional wellbeing needs of students facing multiple disabilities.

"Some students have multiple disabilities, for example, deafness and low level of intelligence. Those students have even been more severely impacted by the school closures

_

¹⁷ See Bartlett et al., 2020

as they require special attention from the school." Said a school principal at one of the five Special Education High Schools.

When asked about the situation after resuming physical classes, most trainees claimed they were still worried about the physical interaction as they could get infected. One trainee said "I was afraid of getting infected with COVID-19 as I would not be able to cover the treatment cost."

Trainees reported that they needed to earn income to support themselves or their family. During the lockdowns and restrictions, since they were restricted from travelling, they struggled financially and with added stress.

"I needed to work to support my wife and kids, but I was not allowed to travel, I was struggling so much since there was no income to support my family," said a male trainee at the NISE.

7.2 Impacts of COVID-19 on Student's Learning

One significant impact of COVID-19 has been the shift to online learning. Assistive technology does help students with disabilities to learn. Across Cambodia, during the school closure, learning and teaching was moved online. Both types of students with disabilities' learning have been impacted severely as each type of disability required a specific method or specific assistive technology. However, the pandemic came unexpectedly, which meant that both teachers and students were not ready to shift entirely online. Students with disabilities felt the impact of challenges in online learning more than students without disabilities.

Limited knowledge and availability of assistive technology

Assistive technology has been used for online teaching for students with and without disabilities. One of the prevailing challenges teachers and specialists face is the lack of skills and knowledge on the utilization of assistive technology which affects use. The individualized education program (IEP) team needs to determine the individual needs of the students for support using technology services to select the best assistive technologies that can be adapted to ensure student learning even through virtual means.¹⁸ Appropriate assistive technology can facilitate and maximize the educational opportunities for their performance (Alnahdi, 2014) amid the pandemic. ¹⁹ The teachers and parents themselves need to be trained in using the assistive technologies during home quarantine or even after the pandemic so that the students can continue learning using the existing technologies available to them. Likewise, suggested technologies assist students with disabilities and include word processors, proofreading programs, spell-checking programs, speech

¹⁸ See Mahmoud, 2018

¹⁹ See Alnahdi, 2014

recognition, speech synthesis, optical character recognition system, talking calculators, Free-Form Databases, etc.²⁰

However, in the case of Cambodia, because of the lack of preparation as the pandemic was unexpected not just for Cambodia but also in other countries, both teachers and students were not ready to use the assistive technology. Due to limited technical skills and knowledge and limited availability of this technology, both teachers and students found that using these assistive technologies was extremely challenging. Visually impaired students benefited from Google to help read text, but this assistive technology works with the English text. For Khmer text, it does not work smoothly. Technological literacy amongst parents and caretakers is also is very low, so it is difficult for them to help their children learn.

"I can use Google to help translate texts into voices. It helps a lot with my learning, but it only works well for English texts. For Khmer texts, it does not work well," said a hard of hearing student at Kampong Cham Special High School.

Online teaching and learning required much more effort from both the teachers and students. Teachers were unprepared for the transition to online learning. They also lacked technical knowledge or experience with online teaching platforms and were not provided with any training even after the school closure. Facebook Messenger was the common platform they could use for communication and teaching students. Teachers worked together to produce videos and soundtracks for the students. One of the teachers said, "We were not prepared for such a situation, and we did not have much knowledge with online teaching. We were not provided any training, but our colleague had knowledge in the internet technology, and he helped us with making videos."

However, the teachers accepted that online teaching is not as effective as teaching in the classroom and as one teacher said "It requires interaction and touching to make students with vision impairment learn, but it cannot be done online. Subjects related to sciences are most difficult to teach online." To the students, online learning requires quite good assistance from their family members, which is challenging for many students.

"At the beginning, we started to learn how to use Google classroom, Zoom, Telegram, and Messenger to teach students. Because we were new to those things, it took us time to learn to use it," said a teacher at a High School for Special Education in Phnom Penh.

In order to assist students to learn during the pandemic, the MoEYS and development partners recorded videos. However, the videos were recorded for students in general, without special attention to students with disabilities except for sign language translation. Students with vision impairments claimed that even with the recorded videos, they could not really see what was inside

-

²⁰ Raskind, 1994

the video because things in the videos were too small. In addition, students with hearing difficulties also found that it is very hard for them to understand the contents even with sign language translation as they were not able to follow the contents and the translation at the same time well. In the physical classrooms, hard of hearing students were able to ask for clarification or further explanation.

"My parents were very busy with making income, so they could not help me much with my learning. When I had questions, I sent a voice message to my teacher, but sometimes she could respond quickly and sometimes it took a while for her to respond," said a visually impaired student from Battambang Special Education High School.

Students with vision impairment depend quite heavily on physical contact to learn specific subjects such as mathematics, physics, and chemistry; however, such elements were missing in online learning, as a student emphasized: 'It was hard for me to learn mathematics, physics, and chemistry online as I could not visualize what my teacher described to me; however, in the classroom my teacher allowed me to touch things which helps me understand them better.' Even those with low vision had difficulties learning online because the contents in the video were not large enough for them to view. Moreover, it was difficult for students to concentrate at home. One of the students mentioned that "It was a bit noisy at home, making me losing focus on my learning," and some others also claimed that they were asked to help with various types of housework.

Lack of Smart Devices and Internet Connection

Access to smart devices and the internet was very limited for students. For instance, one of the students mentioned that "I was not able to study online because my parents could not afford to buy a smart phone for me," while two other students stated that "I had a smart phone, but I lived far from the town, so the internet connection was very bad which was not convenient for online learning." One of the students also complained about spending money on internet, "I needed to spend at least \$4 a month on internet so that I could learn online," and another noted, "There was a time when my parents were so busy that they did not have time to refill the phone balance and I was not able to learn for almost a week." In order to assist students with financial difficulty, some schools provided certain financial support (\$1 per week) to students to refill their phone balance. "We used budget allocated for buying equipment to help our students. We gave them \$1 a week to refill their phone balance," a school principal. Some devices were made available to students, but the availability of the devices was very limited compared to the demand. Some of the devices were also of low quality. A few students with low vision managed to get paid jobs and abandoned online learning. After school resumed, they did not want to return to school as they were happy with the money earned from their job.

In addition to lack of smart devices and internet costs, lack of reliable internet made it difficult for students to attend online classes. For example, when Battambang Special Education High School and Siem Reap Special Education High School were required to close temporarily during the COVID-19 outbreak, management noted that less than 50 percent of the students were able to do online learning due to the lack of internet connection and smart devices.

"We called their parents to show them and the students about how to learn via online platforms, but only less than 50 percent of the students were able to do online learning because they do not have a smart phone or though they have one, the internet connection was very bad because they live quite far away from the city," said the school management of Siem Reap Special Education High School.

Effectiveness of Teaching and Learning Online

The effectiveness of online teaching has been questioned due to the compounding factors already noted. In terms of teaching and learning, a school director mentioned that all learning and teaching was turned online and, yet he believed it was not really effective as many trainers did not have stable internet and limited knowledge of online platform for teaching. He added that there was no special training for the teachers to improve their capacity in online teaching due to Covid-19 restrictions and social distancing measures. He also claimed that the teaching approaches commonly used before the pandemic by trainers were not effective at all when applied to online teaching. He added many activities such as teamwork or group discussions were not used, making the online teaching quite boring and less interactive. Moreover, the teaching pace was very slow compared to physical teaching and thus many lessons were not covered. The teachers were also unable to control the students' attendance. Moreover, he added that some teachers complained about the extra cost of the internet for teaching as there was no budget support to cover this. A one-time \$6 budget for phone cards was supplied, but this was for training workshop organized by UNICEF only. In addition, the common tools used by trainers were Zoom and Google Forms, which requires more effort,.

"The teaching and learning were not effective. Most teachers complained to me about online teaching as it was not effective, and they needed to double their effort. Some teachers had to return to their hometown in the province where there was little internet coverage. The trainees needed to use Android apps to read the text on the screen to help them learn, yet the app worked well with only English language, not Khmer language," said one of the management team members at the NISE.

When asked to describe their challenges and concerns during the Covid-19 outbreak, the teacher trainees expressed several frustrations. Most trainees complained that they had to work from home due to lockdowns. They were required to use Zoom and other online platforms for working and teaching; however, it was very inconvenient because sign language requires interaction to make communications more effective, but such interactions are impossible with online teaching and learning. One of the trainees stated that the "internet wasn't really good. I needed to wait until the internet was good so that I can work or teach. I had to work any time of the day depending on the

stability of the internet." Another trainee said, "I was not able to communicate with my students properly due to the internet connection."

Students also struggled with online learning. One of the students stated that 'I did not understand much from the lesson videos sent by my teachers. Even though there is sign language interpretation in the video, I could not understand much, and my parents did not really help me with the lesson.' Most of the students reported wanting to return to school. They stated that they had no one to talk to at home as their family members did not know sign language. Some were not able to understand what other members of their family were talking about, making them feel alone and ignored. One student claimed that living in the house was just like living in the prison.

A few students claimed that they enjoyed learning online, but the internet connection was not stable, creating difficulties for them to learn. Most students mentioned that they did not have any computers and that smartphones were the only device they used for learning. Most students complained that they did not really know how to use applications for learning. A few students complained about not having enough food to eat due to poverty; however, some claimed that they had money, but they were not able to go out and buy food due to restrictions. Some students did not have many things to do at home, while some had to help with various household chores and their parents' business.

When asked to compare learning in a normal public school, many of the interviewed students complained that it was difficult due the large number of students in the class. Also, the teacher did not use sign language. A student added that there was no communication with other students or teachers. Many mentioned that they had friends in the class, but they were not willing to help them as they were also focusing on the lesson as well.

7.3 Impacts of COVID-19 on Parental Selective Behavior

Limited financial resources for buying smart devices and paying internet fees, combined with parental stress was noted to affect parental decision making in regards to their children. Some parents were noted to favor children without disabilities in education. This case could be found in the study.

"I have several siblings, and in my family, we do not have smart phones for all. My parents would give the smart phones to my siblings who are not disabled," said a student at Battambang Special Education High School.

The director of the NISE also stated that online teaching puts a lot of pressure on parents as the teachers required parents to provide extra care for their children and help them learn virtually. When asked about the situation after resuming physical classes, the director mentioned that though physical classes have been resumed, some online tools are still used for teaching; for example,

Telegram is still being used by the teacher to distribute documents and assignments for their trainees.

The teachers also claimed that it was difficult to make students concentrate on the lessons. One stated that "I couldn't assess their understanding." Some also complained that since they had to work from home, they also needed to take care of their own children, which distracted them from working with the students. One of the trainees mentioned that she had students with specialized needs that could not be met. These students learn better with pictures, but this could not be done effectively through online learning. The teacher added that students' parents complained that their children's behavior was getting worse after they were required to learn from home.

Most teachers claimed that they requested their students to learn using video materials produced by the MoEYS in which sing language interpretation was included. However, they felt that such methods were not as effective as interactions with students. One of the teachers stated that students needed special support from the teachers. Only with the help of the teachers in the physical classroom can the students learn well. The majority of the teachers claimed that not many students attended Zoom lessons and it was really hard to know if the students were really focusing on the teaching. The teachers added that sometimes they requested the students' parents to assist their children while learning via zoom and to make sure that the students were focusing on the online teaching.

When asked how their students felt about online learning, all the teachers claimed that their students complained about learning online. They stated that their students were very stressed when learning from home as they were not able to meet their friends and they would be very happy to return to school. However, teachers also noted that other factors impacted students' ability to learn, such as getting jobs. One teacher mentioned that a few parents did not want their children to return to school as they needed them to help them with their business and housework as they believed that there was no use for their children to get educated since they were blind or deaf.

When asked what kind of support both the teachers and students need to prepare for future crises, some students noted that they needed special attention and assistance from their parents or family members to help them learn virtually. Many also requested the support of smart devices to learn online as their parents could not afford one for each child especially when they have multiple children learning at the same time. Those with low vision stated that they needed a proper place to learn because there was not enough light at home.

Teachers noted that they needed a platform designed specifically for teaching students with vision impairment, as one of them mentioned "We needed to use a few different apps to teach our students and it was very inconvenient. There should be one single platform that we can use especially for our students." The teachers also claimed that it could be good to have textbooks for students with

low vision because the current textbooks are not convenient for them and they need magnifiers to help them read.

7.4 COVID-19 Impacts and Inclusive Classrooms

Inclusive education recognizes the right of every child and young person – without exception – to be included in general education settings. It involves adapting the environment and teaching approaches to ensure genuine and valued full participation of all children and young people. Besides challenges related to COVID-19, students with vision impairment also claimed to have faced a few other challenges. Students at special education high schools are required to study one shift at public school. As the teachers at public school need to cover a lot of lessons and there are a lot of students in the class, most teachers seem to pay little attention to the students with vision impairment. Students also accepted that they sometimes lost motivation to study at public school, but they did not have a choice.

Regarding inclusive education for students with disabilities, the director stated that students with disabilities had faced numerous challenges in a normal classroom even before the COVID-19 outbreak. Most of them could not catch up with the rest of the class and were not given enough attention. For hard of hearing students, they need to have sign language interpreters to help them understand the lessons better; however, this would require many interpreters. For visually impaired students, they found it difficult to understand when the teacher used demonstrative pronounces such as 'this/that' to explain since they could not visualize what the teacher was referring to. When asked to describe their students' learning at normal schools, they claimed that there was no inclusiveness at normal public schools. They added that the teachers at public schools did not know sign language. Most of the teachers believed that it could be good to have sign language interpreters in each class at normal public schools.

8. Conclusion and Recommendations

This study was focused on only two types of disabilities – students with auditory and visual impairments. Visually impaired and hard of hearing students were emotionally impacted by the COVID-19 due to fear and communication constraints. Students from disadvantaged families who required food assistance and accommodation were even more severely impacted. Online learning impacted these students ability to receive quality education as a lack of assistive technology, lack of skills and knowledge on using the technology, lack of family and community support, and lack of finances all impacted their ability to learn.

Recommendations to support students with disabilities during the pandemic Emotional support:

During the pandemic and restrictions, persons with disabilities felt worried and fearful due to lack of support and information. Parents and members of the families should try to support persons with disabilities, so that they feel secure. Family members should spend more time talking with them, making sure that they are not left behind. Parents and communities should learn sign languages to communicate with hard of hearing students.

Educational support:

For effective learning for students with disabilities, several areas should be addressed:

- Learning Pods (Correa-Torres and Muthukumaran, 2022): A learning pod is a small group of children who come together to learn and socialize. The learning pod was used for students who did not have Internet access or did not have adult support at home. These students were still doing remote learning, but they were supported by educational assistants, itinerant teachers, therapists, and other professionals to access their remote learning environments. Such Pods were easier to provide services for younger students and tactile learners in their caseload as compared to being completely remote.
- Reducing content delivery and adjusting instructional methods (Alshawabkeh, Woolsey and Kharbat, 2021): Content delivery is one of the factors that determines deaf students' success in education using online distance learning. Trying to cover a large volume of content like in a physical setting minimizes important interactive activities for students. At the same time, instructional methods should be adapted to the new setting; for example, integrating a visual discussion session, video presentation, infographic content, and pop-up polls within the lecture will diversify opportunities to reach students. It is also important to consider new forms of assessments and how they may be adapted to online distance learning.
- Formal training for the students with an interpreter on the use of the online platform prior to the first class (Alshawabkeh, Woolsey, and Kharbat, 2021): Students had difficulty catching up with the teaching, as only the teacher's slide was pinned on the screen and the interpreter appeared on a small frame at the corner of the screen. Therefore, it is important that the instructors, the interpreter, and the content can all be seen simultaneously.
- Providing necessary high-quality equipment and technology and improving accessibility and usage of learning materials. Many institutions have digitized their content; however, it is still inaccessible due to a lack of captioning and unclear audio, among other issues.
- Improve collaboration and partnership. The proposed solutions indicate the important role played by the government, teachers, parents, and specialists in improving education outcomes for students with disabilities.

9. Case Study: Australian Successful School Intervention

The Important of Social Supports for Student with Disabilities in Australia

Extracted from Smith, et al, (2022): Successful School Interventions for Students with Disability During Covid-19: Empirical Evidence from Australia. Asia-Pacific Edu Ref

Australia represents a successful case for interventions for students with disabilities during COVID-19. During the pandemic, the government issued the following interventions:

In the early stages of the COVID-19 pandemic, Australian health authorities and state and federal governments responded to the propagation of the infection by recommending people reduce their face-to-face interactions. This quickly turned into mandatory lockdowns of economic activities and school closures after the first few deaths. School shutdowns were implemented in all states by late March 2020 and remained closed in most states until May. School holidays were brought forward and extended while remote learning platforms were adopted. Although some schools remained opened for some children, including some special schools and classes for the children of workers considered 'essential' during the pandemic (e.g., nurses, doctors and some transport and shop workers), the disruption to schooling (and parents), was widespread.

Furthermore, the transformation of schooling into a set of learning activities that predominantly took place online had dramatic consequences for households' wellbeing: parents, often 'temporarily suspended' from work or even laid off due the sharp downward trend in economic activity, suddenly found themselves juggling the demands of finding or maintaining an income and those of parenting children engaged in remote learning. Unsurprisingly, parents reported rapidly worsening mental health conditions as a product of these significant pressures. Lockdowns and restricted access to on-campus learning continues to be the lived experience of many Australian young people.

Social support: social support is a protective factor for the mental health and wellbeing of young people with intellectual disability and is a key consideration when supporting people in remote teaching and learning. Social distancing, school closures and learning online have disrupted the educational lives of these students and their families. To mitigate these disruptions, social support is the form of support that is most valued by the students with disabilities and families. Learning and engagement that take place via social activities and with social support are most likely to have relevant effects on learning and engagement during this prolonged period of disruption. Children and young people with disability, already coping with discrimination and social exclusion before the pandemic, felt and are feeling the impact of COVID-19 quite severely, especially when schools had to close and online learning activities were often the only option left to continue schooling. As the crisis has continued, and chronic uncertainty, multiple

disruptions, remote learning and social isolation has been the experience of many young people, the adverse effects on mental health are likely to become more prevalent. Being cut off from peers and teachers removed a fundamental channel through which children and young adults with disabilities grow as students and individuals. The concerns are identified more broadly in research identifying structural inequalities within many of the services and resources for people with disabilities. Attention to providing social support and opportunities for social activity with social-emotional support and instruction during synchronous online instruction can provide inclusion opportunities.

These supports can include developing supported social emotional skills to seek help in coping with anxiety (following Khodadadi et al., 2017), addressing some of the social isolation by securing ongoing and further relationships with teachers and peers. Disruptions to the routines of social activity and support that help young people, especially young people with disabilities thrive (Gilmore et al., 2016) can be further addressed with social supports. They promote self-efficacy and self-determining choices (ColonCabrera et al., 2021) reinforcing the communication of support needs for academic support and improving feedback loops between educators and students (Campbell & Gilmore, 2014; Hood, 2020).

According to Smith (2022), the result that social support was the single most important form of support positively associated with all aspects of perceived learning outcomes covered in the CYDA survey, while reducing feelings of isolation, is a clear indication of what schools could do to engage children and young adults with disability in remote learning, and where to direct financial resources. Scaffolds and supports for peer relationships between all students will benefit all students. Interactive activities, such as collaborative learning activities online, opportunities to participate in social-emotional learning in group communication and collaboration were among those strategies identified as effective. Explicit attention to skills in building and maintaining relationships are likely to support and maintain social networks (Page et al., 2021; Drane et al., 2021) can help to develop coping skills and opportunities for peer to peer and teacher to student understanding (Cavioni et al., 2017). Connecting the experiences of learning to home and taking time to assess the challenges and strategies that students used to cope and engage with their learning in different environments will assist in skill and empathy building (following Espelage et al., 2015; Hulvershorn & Mulholland, 2018; Khodadadi et al., 2017; Masi et al., 2021). Connecting with young people and their families to inform schools and teachers about what works, what might work better, and what has been learned from the experiences of remote learning, particularly around social support, will further allow this work to be done with dignity, informed by the knowledge and understanding of the young person's experience (Children and Young People with Disability [CYDA], 2020; Colon-Cabrera et al., 2021).

In Australia, the importance of social support may be also at the core of why non-government schools seem to have been more effective in their support relative to government schools, in that they may cater for a more homogeneous group of students, whose needs were easier to organize. It is also possible that non-government schools have more resources to support students with disability, or, alternatively, that families of students with disability attending non-government schools are richer or better resourced to support their children's education.

Turning to the insights from families and young people, building skills in the use of technology and computers including how to log in, manage apps and practice communication in different digital mediums for young people needs more attention, as does the communication around support strategies between school and home.

Importantly, attention to professional development for teachers preparing them to support and inform the learning of young people with disability in digital and in-person teaching, drawing on the experiences of isolation reported during remote learning, would further support progress in providing inclusive learning experiences.

Bibliography

- 1. Cambodia's Law on the Protection and the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities promulgated in 03 July 2009.
- 2. ILO Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment (Disabled Persons) Convention (No. 159), 1983; UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with disabilities, adopted on 03 July 2009; and Cambodia's Law on the Protection and the Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities dated 03 July 2009.
- 3. National Institute of Statistics, Ministry of Planning, Census of the population in the Kingdom of Cambodia 2019, National Report on Final Results, October 2020
- 4. UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with disabilities, adopted on 03 July 2009.

Appendixes

Appendix 1: Questionnaires

Questionnaires for NISE

- 1. What are laws related to the rights of persons with the disabilities in particular rights to education?
- 2. What are policies related to the rights of persons with the disabilities in particular rights to education?
- 3. How did you give exam and monitor trainees' learning? Please explain?
- 4. Among those laws and policies, are there any responses to support people with disabilities related rights of education during COVID-19?
- 5. If yes, how are they implemented. If no, what are the responses taken by your institution? Please elaborate.
- 6. Can you share your good practices in supporting people with disabilities during COVID-19 from your institution as well as from what you have known from other places or countries?
- 7. As DPs/or Development Agencies, do you have any flexibility policies to support people with disabilities, in relation to rights to education?
- 8. What are the challenges people with disabilities faced by people with disabilities during COVID-19 in particularly related to rights to education?
- 9. Among males, females, age groups, and standard of living, who are severely impacted by COVID-19 in particularly related to rights to education?
- 10. What are your recommendations or suggestions to the government in order to tackle the impacts on the persons with disabilities for the future pandemic?

Questions for trainers of trainees with disabilities

- 1. Are there training programs for trainers to teach students during the COVID-19 pandemic?
- 2. Are there any platform or methodology to teach students during COVID-19? Have you applied the same or different methods from pre-COVID-19? Please explain?
- 3. If no, what is guidance or instruction provided to the trainers?
- 4. How effective is the training during COVID-19? Please explain.
- 5. What are the challenges in teaching the trainees during the COVID-19?
- 6. What are the challenges of trainees' learning during COVID-19?
- 7. How have the trainees been impacted by COVID-19 in terms of their learning? Please explain.
- 8. What have you done to assist trainees to learn during COVID-19?
- 9. Are there any comments or suggestions to improve learning for people with disabilities for the future pandemic?

Questions for trainees/students with disabilities

- 1. Could you please tell me about the challenges you faced during COVID-19?
- 2. How did you enroll at your school or institute during COVID-19?
- 3. How were exams given during the COVID-19? If the exams were provided online, how effective were they? Please explain?
- 4. Did you feel that you would drop out of the class due to COVID-19? Please explain.
- 5. How helpful were your trainers/teachers and parents in helping you learn during the COVID-19 pandemic?
- 6. Could you please tell me about the challenges you faced in learning?
- 7. How did you learn during the COVID-19?
- 8. Did you like or dislike learning via online platform, if provided? Please explain.
- 9. If you learned via online platform, which mode is more convenient between online and physical modes?
- 10. If you learned via online platform, how effective was it? Please explain.
- 11. What supports did you need during the COVID-19 pandemic? Please explain.
- 12. Do you have any suggestions recommendations to help students with disabilities learn better for future pandemic?

Questions for parents

- 1. How did you see your child situation during COVID-19?
- 2. What burden did you face in helping your child to learn during COVID-19 pandemic?
- 3. Did you see your child perform better or worse during COVID-19 pandemic? Please explain?
- 4. How much did your child learn during COVID-19 compared with pre-COVID-19? Please explain.
- 5. What support would you so that your child could learn more during COVID-19?
- 6. What are your suggestions to improve students with disabilities' education for the future pandemic?

Appendix 2: Statistics of students with disabilities and the 5 classes for Special Education Academic Year 2021-2022

No	Level	Blind		N.Class	Deaf		N.Class	Total		N.Class
		Total	Femal e	N.Class	Total	Female	14.Class	Total	Female	14.Class
1	Low									
	Medium									
	High				12	5	1	12	5	1

Total					12	5	1	12	5	1
2	Grade 1	32	13	6	111	47	7	143	70	13
	Grade 2	17	6	4	62	29	5	79	35	9
	Grade 3	15	8	4	84	25	6	99	51	10
	Grade 4	15	8	4	67	25	6	82	33	10
	Grade 5	5	1	2	51	19	6	56	20	8
	Grade 6	15	4	3	49	19	6	64	23	9
	Total	99	40	23	424	182	36	523	232	59
3	Grade 7	15	7	3	40	19	5	55	26	8
	Grade 8	19	4	4	39	17	5	58	21	9
	Grade 9	16	3	4	32	10	5	48	13	9
	Total	50	14	11	111	46	15	161	60	26
4	Grade 10	16	8	4	24	8	4	40	16	8
	Grade 11	6	3	2	14	5	4	20	8	5
	Grade 12	9	6	2	13	8	4	22	14	6
Total		31	17	8	51	21	12	82	38	19
TOTAL		180	71	42	598	254	64	778	325	106

The National University of Management's Research Center was established as a result of the commitment of the National University of Management with the aims to promote the process of scientific research and the publishing activities of all academicians and researchers from faculties of the National University of Management. National University of Management's Research Center conducts a range of research activities with faculty curriculum and joint research activities with university partners; organizes academic research competition; provides certificate programs; and implements research projects.

CONTACT US

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MANAGEMENT'S RESEARCH CENTER

St.96 Christopher Howes, Khan Daun Penh,
Phnom Penh, Cambodia
+855 (0) 81 882 122

info.researchcenter@num.edu.kh









